Guidelines for submitting comments on papers published in IEEE Sensors Journal

IEEE Sensors Journal encourages post-publications discussions through comments on recently published articles and aims to facilitate community evaluation and discourse around published material. The guidelines below may be used for this purpose:

1. Scope of Comments:

Comments are meant to encourage post-publication discussion and are publication items that criticize or clarify articles of other authors recently published in the IEEE Sensors Journal. Comments section could also be used to discuss the content, conclusions, and consequences of a specific article published in the IEEE Sensors Journal. The contents of a Comment should be directed to the technical aspects in the paper being criticized; statements on other matters, such as perceived citation omissions, are not generally suitable for publication as Comments, and can be addressed most effectively through direct contact with the authors of the original paper. In case of factual errors, an Erratum by the authors of the original paper (with appropriate acknowledgment, if necessary) is preferred whenever it will suffice in place of a Comment and Reply. As a general practice, the comments will be accompanied by the reply from authors of the original paper.

2. Guidelines for preparing Comments:

Each Comment should contain an abstract and should clearly state the paper to which it refers. The IEEE Journal Style for preparing the manuscripts should be used. A Reply to a Comment must also conform to these requirements. The comments and reply to comments should normally have 1 page length. To be considered for publication, a Comment and the reply to Comment should be written in a collegial tone (free from polemics) and must be pertinent. A non-exhaustive list of discussion standards includes the following:

- a. Language that is insulting, inflammatory, or obscene will not be tolerated.
- b. Comments must be evidence-based, not authority-based. Arguments based on belief are to be avoided. Unsupported assertions or statements should be avoided.
- c. Unpublished data should be provided with sufficient methodological detail for those data to be assessed. Alternatively, a permanent Web link to such information should be provided.
- d. Discussions should be confined to the demonstrable content of articles and should avoid speculation about the motivations or prejudices of authors.
- e. Questions about experimental data are appropriate, but need to be phrased in a way that does not imply any misconduct on the part of the authors. If a reader is concerned about potential misconduct, such concerns must always be raised with editorial staff at IEEE Sensors Journal.

3. Reviewing Procedure for Comments:

- a. The paper is sent to the authors whose work is being criticized or commented on. These authors should provide a report, following the normal guidelines for referees. This report will be sent to the authors of the Comment for possible revision with the understanding that the Comment will be reviewed further. At this stage, the authors of the original paper should send only a report suitable for transmission to the authors of the Comment; they will be given the opportunity to write a Reply at a later date.
- b. After suitable exchanges between the involved parties, the Comment, along with relevant correspondence, is sent to a neutral referee for anonymous review. If the recommendation is to accept the Comment, the authors whose work is being commented on are given the opportunity to write a Reply. This Reply will also be reviewed; usually by the neutral referee(s).
- c. After the Comment and Reply are accepted for publication, the authors of the Comment are sent a copy of the Reply for their information, but should not alter the Comment unless requested to do so by the Editor. The Comment and Reply will be usually published in the same issue. If, however, the Reply is unduly delayed, it may be published in a later issue; if a Reply is deemed unnecessary, none will be published.

4. How to Submit Comments

The Comment or Reply to Comments can be uploaded via manuscript central. For the submission type, authors should use 'comments' from the drop-down menu.

4 August 2014